

**External Evaluation of the Indian Health Service
Navajo Area Injury Prevention Program:
Evaluation Report – Executive Summary**

Submitted by:

**Carolyn E. Crump, PhD
Robert J. Letourneau, MPH**

University of North Carolina
Injury Prevention Research Center

Submitted to:

Nancy Bill, MPH
Navajo Area Injury Prevention Specialist

Kelly Taylor
Principal Injury Prevention Consultant,
Indian Health Service

June 2000

This Executive Summary outlines the major findings outlined in the Navajo Area (NA) Injury Prevention Program (IPP) Evaluation Report completed in April 2000 by Carolyn E. Crump, PhD and Robert J. Letourneau, MPH of the University of North Carolina Injury Prevention Research Center. The contents of this summary were prepared based on an assessment of the NA IPP conducted from 1997-1999. The NA served as one of two pilot sites for the development of evaluation methods, procedures, and processes that will be used to evaluate all IHS Area Injury Prevention Programs. Included in this Executive Summary are the Stage of Development ratings for the 12 Evaluation Components used to guide the evaluation process:

- | | |
|--------------------------------------|---|
| 1. Mission/Vision | 7. Needs Assessment/Defined Service Population |
| 2. Resource Allocation/Accounting | 8. Surveillance Data Collection |
| 3. Management Support | 9. Injury Program Planning and Implementation |
| 4. Staffing/Roles & Responsibilities | 10. Marketing |
| 5. Training | 11. Evaluation/Reporting |
| 6. Partnerships/Collaboration | 12. Technical Assistance/Building Tribal Capacity |

A brief summary of recommendations is also provided for each Evaluation Component. Please refer to the full-text version of the NA IPP Evaluation Report for the following: background on the development of the evaluation process; an overview of the NA IPP; a description of the Program Stage of Development Process; contextual factors used to determine stage of development ratings; and a comprehensive list of resources for NA IPP staff.

1. Mission/Vision

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	---------------------	---------------

The Navajo Area (NA) Injury Prevention Program (IPP) is at the **Intermediate** stage of development for Mission/Vision. The evaluators recommend that some additional, more systematic, approaches to program planning be considered to augment current program planning by District and Service Unit staff that is based on local surveillance data and community needs. An Area-wide program plan is not fully developed. The evaluators recommend that an Area-wide strategic planning approach be developed to guide the types, focus, and emphasis of specific activities at the Area level, as well as at the District and Service Unit levels. This approach could also identify Area Office staff activities (e.g., coordination with state level groups) that would better support the District and Service Unit IP Staff in their more localized efforts. The evaluators also recommend that Area, District, and Service Unit IP staff consider developing an annual program planning process that is based upon the 12 Evaluation Components guiding this Area Evaluation. NA IPP staff may prioritize planning based on Evaluation Components identified as being at the Basic or Intermediate stage of development in this report. Finally, the evaluators recommend that a program planning advisory panel be established to guide program planning processes.

2. Resource Allocation/Accounting

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	----------------------

The NA IPP is at the **Comprehensive** stage for Resource Allocation/Accounting. To maintain this stage of the development, staff in the NA should continue to use the decentralized funding process for demonstration projects, which allows for more local control in identifying, developing, and implementing injury prevention activities. The general processes used in Shiprock and Tuba City to distribute funds within the District should be used as a model for distributing these funds in other Districts. The

evaluators recommend that the methods and results of the distribution of funds for demonstration projects be periodically reviewed and revised to increase the effective use of the funds. To enhance the current demonstration project funding system incremental funding should be provided to Districts and/or Service Units that is based, in part, on project evaluation. Requiring evaluation results as a criteria for continued funding will likely encourage District, Service Unit, and Tribal staff to collect evaluation data. Project managers should be encouraged to identify measurable objectives during the program planning phase of the project, not after implementation has started. Another modification could be to allow for year-to-year carry over of injury prevention funds (similar to Project 121 funds). This may eliminate the rush to spend year end funds and may also facilitate long-term sustainability of some demonstration projects, particularly those that would be better designed for time periods that extend beyond 12-months. In addition, the evaluators suggest that staff in the Navajo Area document the types of external funding used to support injury prevention activities to better target additional sources of support for local injury prevention activities. The strategic planning recommendations in this report may also increase the ability of the Area and Service Unit Injury Prevention Programs to compete for grant funds.

3. Management Support

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	----------------------

The NA IPP is at the **Comprehensive** stage of development for Management Support. To maintain this stage of development, funding supporting the District and Service Unit staff positions, as well as for local project funding, should continue to be allocated to injury prevention activities. The evaluators recommend that Area Office support for the program be maintained through the continued practice of monthly conference calls between Area Office (Nancy Bill and Ralph Fulgham) and District and Service Unit Staff. The evaluators suggest that additional exposure and discussion regarding the Navajo Area, District, and Service Unit injury prevention program activities be developed with Chapter and Tribal Council representatives because not all Tribal Chapter Administrators are "fully on board" with the injury prevention program. It may be especially appropriate to focus attention on improving relationships with Chapter members who do not regularly communicate with injury prevention program staff.

4. Staffing/Roles and Responsibilities

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	----------------------

The NA IPP is at the **Comprehensive** stage of development for Staffing/Roles and Responsibilities. To enhance this component, the evaluators recommend that more unified job descriptions for District and Service Unit IPC staff be created and implemented to ensure consistency of injury prevention responsibilities and duties across Districts and Service Units. Specifically, the evaluators suggest that both Area and District IPP staff build into their job responsibilities a distinction regarding who is responsible for developing relationships with external partners supporting the NA IPP. The development of this component could be advanced through an annual planning process which identifies staff responsible for developing specific state and national relationships. The evaluators also suggest that roles across the entire Navajo Area be revisited and discussed on a regular basis (e.g., annually) to clarify assumptions and ensure that IP staff expectations are met. For example, a staff development workshop or training should be considered to develop IP staff's ability to transcend personal differences in management and communication styles. Such training could increase effective communication between NA staff and can develop team building among IPP staff. The evaluators commend the approach that is being tested in the Fort Defiance District regarding specializing staff roles and responsibilities. The results of this innovative staffing plan should be shared with other District EH and IP staff in the Navajo Area. Finally, the

evaluators recommend that the Navajo Area IPP consider instituting an annual Area-wide staff award for outstanding achievement in injury prevention. Developing such an award system will focus on the many positive contributions that Navajo Area staff provide on behalf of the Navajo Area Injury Prevention Program.

5. Training

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	----------------------

The NA IPP is at the **Comprehensive** stage of development for Training. To enhance the development of this evaluation component, the evaluators recommend that Area, District, and Service Unit staff develop a set of standard procedures for announcing training opportunities and recruiting qualified participants for trainings held within and outside the Area. Specifically, the evaluators encourage the NA IPP staff to strategically plan and assess the degree to which Chapter Leaders have received injury prevention training as a way to recruitment future training course participants. The evaluators also recommend that the NA IPP staff do a better job of documenting what courses are offered and documenting who attends the courses. For the NA-specific Level I course, the evaluators encourage course instructors to review materials related to adult learning principles and practices. The evaluators also suggest that instructors for the courses be based in several different NA Districts and/or Service Units, and that course coordinators consider using speakers/presenters from outside the Navajo Area. Because waiting lists for training courses exist, additional training opportunities per year should be considered by NA IPP staff. The evaluators suggest that as part of the Area/District/Service Unit Annual Planning process, specific needs for IP training be identified. Based on those specific training needs and surveillance data, a set of workshops and/or courses should be developed specific to each District. Finally, the evaluators recommend that NA IPP staff provide adequate support, assistance, and mentoring to those who participate in the IHS Injury Prevention Fellowship Program.

6. Partnerships/Collaboration

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	---------------------	---------------

The NA IPP is at the **Intermediate** stage of development for Partnerships/Collaboration. The evaluators suggest that Nancy and other NA IPC Staff build on their many relationships and expand them in ways that lead to the implementation of IP projects. Having a set of specific ideas and project proposals, outlined in the Area IP strategic plan, will assist NA Area IPC staff by focusing their attention on collaborations leading to the joint implementation of specific IP interventions. This approach may assist in determining what type of relationships will be further developed to support the NA injury prevention program. It may be helpful if a worksheet was developed to record all current partnerships and the types of activities on which the NA has collaborated with each partner. Also listed on the worksheet should be the mission or concerns of the partnering agency. The evaluators suggest that both Area and District IPP staff build into their job responsibilities a distinction regarding who is responsible for developing which relationships with external partners supporting the NA IPP. Despite expressed challenges in working with staff from the Substance Abuse program, the evaluators recommend that relationships with substance abuse program staff at the Area and Service Unit level be fostered and maintained, particularly given the strong relationship between alcohol and injuries in the Navajo Area. Navajo Area IP staff should also consider ways to increase membership and involvement on local IPC committees. The evaluators stress that there is no substitute for time to build trust. Patience and persistence will pay off as community members realize that they need to contact the IP/EH staff members for advice on local activities. While it is not easy to build local level coalitions there are several models from which the NA IP Program could

learn. The evaluators recommend that the factors affecting the successes of the NA coalitions be studied more closely by the NA IPP staff so that those successes might be implemented within the Navajo Area.

7. Needs Assessment/Defined Service Population

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	---------------------	---------------

The NA IPP is at the **Intermediate** stage of development for Needs Assessment/Defined Service Population. For the Navajo Area to move to the next stage of development for this Evaluation Component, staff should consider developing more formal and regular procedures to collect needs assessment data. While informal methods of collecting needs assessment data are useful, the evaluators recommend that this information be collected as part of a structured way of developing tailored, local-level injury prevention programs in direct response to community member requests. The needs assessment survey conducted in the Winslow Service Unit in 1997 could serve as a model for conducting such assessment in other Service Units. More specifically, the evaluators strongly recommend that the link be made in all Districts between the collection of needs assessment data and annual program planning activities. The process used to develop annual program plans in the Shiprock District could serve as a model for other Districts to use when planning their injury prevention activities. Once collected, the evaluators recommend that an easy-to-read format summarizing the data should be developed, which can be used as a tool to market or lobby for the injury prevention program. In addition to identifying community members' perceived injury prevention needs and interests, a community capacity assessment could be completed. The Evaluators recommend that the needs assessment strategies developed by NA Area IPP staff incorporate the concepts of assets mapping into their data collection plans. Finally, the evaluators suggest that the Area and District Injury Prevention Specialists consider supporting one or more Photovoice projects, which may be appropriate for the Tribal Youth Campaign and/or considered part of the Navajo Area's marketing and injury prevention interventions.

8. Surveillance Data Collection

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	----------------------

The NA IPP is at the **Comprehensive** stage of development for Surveillance Data Collection. Because staff indicated that there are some barriers to collecting comprehensive morbidity data, the evaluators suggest that NA IPP staff consider using project funds or developing a research study for a future IHS Fellowship program participant in order to conduct a small, pilot study to ascertain the extent of the missing data. The evaluators recommend that NA IPP staff create Area-wide surveillance data reports on an annual basis to summarize the information collected about IP activities. These reports could provide an important mechanism for communication with Tribal Representatives regarding the importance of the IP activities and the severity of the problems. Given the advanced nature of the Navajo Area Surveillance System, as compared to other IHS Area systems, the evaluators recommend that staff at the Navajo Area receive training in the use of these advanced computer systems such as Geographic Information System (GIS).

9. Injury Program Planning and Implementation

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	---------------------	---------------

The NA IPP is at the **Intermediate** stage of development for Injury Program Planning and Implementation. To increase the effectiveness of the Navajo Area injury prevention program activities,

the evaluators encourage the staff to implement programs focused on several levels of intervention (e.g., individual, vehicle/vector and environmental change) and using multiple methods (e.g., health education, engineering, policy development, and enforcement). Specifically, to move to the comprehensive level for Injury Program Planning and Implementation, the evaluators recommend that NA Staff develop a strategic approach to reduce injury related morbidity and mortality in the NA by specifically incorporating the four types of interventions outlined in the IOM's *Reducing the Burden of Injury Report* (Bonnie et al., 1999): 1) changing individual behavior; 2) modifying products or agents of injury; 3) modifying the physical environment; and 4) modifying the sociocultural and economic environment. When possible, innovative approaches to emerging injury prevention problems (e.g. intentional injuries) should also be implemented in communities. The Continuous Improvement (CI) process involves beginning with a small “pilot project,” to see what works, and then expanding, changing or improving as necessary. The evaluators recommend that NA IPP staff use a CI process for developing, implementing, and evaluating more effective injury prevention interventions.

10. Marketing

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	---------------------	---------------

The NA IPP is at the **Intermediate** stage of development for Marketing. Existing marketing of the NA IPP has primarily been related to project-specific activities or interventions. In some cases, such as the Gallup District, useful, specific materials have been developed to promote the activities of the injury prevention program and staff. The evaluators suggest that other Districts and/or Service Units follow the model developed in the Gallup District or that Area-wide marketing materials be developed to promote the overall Navajo Area Injury Prevention Program. For example, a Navajo Area Fact Sheet developed to correspond to major program emphasis areas could be developed as part of the Area’s annual program planning process. Fact Sheets could also be designed to highlight the Area program, but with an emphasis on activities that are taking place in Districts and/or Service Units. The evaluators also recommend that some NA IP staff consider obtaining training in marketing or social marketing. In addition, the creation of a NA IPP webpage may also serve as an innovative tool to market the injury prevention program. All marketing materials should be updated and distributed annually to the list of Navajo Area injury prevention practitioners or partners.

11. Evaluation/Reporting

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
--------------	--------------	---------------

The NA IPP is at the Basic stage of Development for Evaluation/Reporting. For the program to advance to the next stage of development for this Evaluation Component, more formal evaluation and reporting mechanisms should be put in place to monitor future injury prevention demonstration projects that are funded by the Area or District/Service Unit. This is an excellent way to ask grantees to justify requests for additional resources to support intervention projects. The evaluators recommend that appropriate training in how to conduct an evaluation should be provided to as many Area, District, Service Unit, and Tribal staff as possible (e.g. from a local university or through self-study using materials referenced in this report). Given that the evaluators feel that the topic of evaluation has not been adequately addressed in the IHS training (e.g., Level I), the evaluators suggest that the Navajo Area re-design it’s Level I and II injury prevention courses to include skill building for evaluation of community injury prevention programs or projects. Regarding reporting, the evaluators recommend that a report preparation workshop be developed to instruct Tribal representatives and Service Unit staff in methods needed to collect and

summarize information regarding intervention projects. Templates and example reports may be included as part of the materials provided to those attending the workshop.

12. Technical Assistance/Building Tribal Capacity

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	----------------------

The NA IPP is at the Comprehensive stage of development for Technical Assistance/Building Tribal Capacity. With the advent of the IHS Tribal Injury Prevention Grants Program funding to Tribes, it is important for Area, District, and Service Unit Office IP staff to provide technical assistance to all Tribal Chapters, Departments, or Organizations in the Navajo Area interested in working to prevent injuries and/or to submit a proposal for grant funding. In general, all NA Area IPC staff should be proactive in the way in which they work with Tribal representatives to advocate for and make suggestions about potential IP activities. Assisting Tribal staff and local coalitions with strategic planning and evaluation reporting are two critical areas needed by Tribal members to increase the effectiveness of their injury prevention activities. Another way to develop relationships between Area, District, and SU IP staff and Tribal representatives is to hold annual IP networking and strategic planning meetings. Establishing an Area Tribal Advisory Committee may also raise awareness of the importance of IP. While these suggestions are probably not new ideas to the NA Area IP staff, action should be taken to turn these ideas into reality.

In summary, the Navajo Area Injury Prevention Program is at the following Stages of Development for the 12 Evaluation Components used to guide the Evaluation:

Evaluation Component	Stage of Development		
	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Mission/Vision	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Resource allocation/Accounting	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Management Support	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Staffing/Roles & Responsibilities	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Training	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Partnerships/Collaboration	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Needs Assessment/Defined Service Population	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Surveillance Data Collection	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Injury Program Planning and Implementation	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Marketing	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Evaluation/Reporting	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
Technical Assistance/Building Tribal Capacity	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive

Navajo Area Injury Prevention Program staff should use the results, recommendations and resources provided in this report to develop an Action Plan to enhance the stages of development for each Evaluation Component used in this assessment process.